

Project Proposal Request for FY 2007 - FY 2009 Funding (Revised Summer 2006)

Proposal 200712000: Malheur Subbasin Habitat Restoration and Fish Enhancement – Logan Valley Project

Table of Contents

Part 1. Administration and Budgeting

- Section 1: General Administrative
- Section 2: Project Location
- Section 3: Project Species
- Section 4: Past Accomplishments
- Section 5: Relationship to Other Projects
- Section 6: Biological Objectives
- Section 7: Work Elements
- Section 8: Budget
- Section 9: Project Future
- Section 10: Documents

Part 2. Reviews

Part 1 of 2. Administration and Budgeting

Section 1: General Administrative Information

Process Information:	Date Proposal Submitted & Finalized	Status	Form Generator
	December 8, 2005	Finalized	Lawrence Schwabe

Proposal Type:	New
Proposal Number:	200712000
Proposal Name:	Malheur Subbasin Habitat Restoration and Fish Enhancement – Logan Valley Project
Agency, Institution or Organization:	Burns Paiute Tribe
Short Description:	This project proposes the acquisition of up to 1120 acres of deeded land in the headwaters of the Malheur River to restore and protect native species habitat and provide an opportunity of the development of interim fishery for the tribe.
Information Transfer:	

Project Proposal Contacts

Contact	Organization	Address	Phone/Email	Roles	Notes
---------	--------------	---------	-------------	-------	-------

Form Submitter				
Lawrence Schwabe	Burns Paiute Tribe	100 Pasigo St. Burns OR 97720	Ph: 541.573.1375 Fax: 541.573.7806 Email: lschwabe@centurytel.net	Form Submitter
All Assigned Contacts				
Lawrence Schwabe	Burns Paiute Tribe	100 Pasigo St. Burns OR 97720	Ph: 541.573.1375 Fax: 541.573.7806 Email: lschwabe@centurytel.net	Technical Contact

Section 2: Project Location

Sponsor Province:	Middle Snake	ARC Province:	No Change			
Sponsor Subbasin:	Malheur	ARC Subbasin:	No Change			
Latitude	Longitude	Waterbody	Location Description	County/State	Subbasin	Primary?
44.12833	118.58222	Malheur River	The project area is located in Logan Valley approximately 15 miles east of Seneca, OR. Access to Logan Valley can be attained by taking Hwy OR395 to Seneca, OR. Proceed east on Forest Road 16 approximately 15 miles. Restoration work shall be conducted on the deeded lands of Lake Creek and McCoy Creek located North of the 16 road at the west end of the valley. Protection O&M is proposed on Lake Creek and Big Creek on both North and South of 16 road.	Grant, Oregon	Malheur	No

Section 3: Focal Species

Primary	Secondary	Additional Species
Bull Trout Interior Redband Trout	Chinook Snake River Spring/Summer ESU	

Section 4: Past Accomplishments for Each Fiscal Year of This Project

This proposal is for funding a new project, and has no past accomplishments.

Section 5: Relationships to Other Projects

Funding Source	Related ID	Related Project Title	Relationship
BPA	199701900	Stinking Water Salmonid Project	This ongoing project is a cooperative project with the Tribe, state, and federal entities to collect critical information for the management of native fish in the Malheur River Subbasin. This project proposes to develop a Monitoring and Evaluation Plan for native salmonids and delegate the monitoring responsibilities to the respective entities. The ongoing project will identify sites that will be monitored by project

BPA	200000900	Logan Valley Wildlife Mitigation	<p>200000900 Logan Valley Wildlife Mitigation Project. This is related to the new proposed project due to the similarities in location and management goals of both properties.</p> <p>The proposed land acquisition is an adjacent property to the ongoing project. The purchase of the property is almost just an extension to the existing project, but the acquisition process is much different. The new proposal is not a wildlife acquisition project, but a substitution project related to the Tribe's destroyed fishery. But the management of the two properties is to have general similarities. In addition, the new proposal seeks the feasibility of the development of "put and take" fish ponds at suitable sites on either or both properties.</p>
-----	-----------	----------------------------------	--

Section 6: Biological Objectives

Biological Objective	Full Description	Associated Subbasin Plan	Strategy	Page Nos
Channel Conditions	To have both a 1) distribution of channel types (e.g. Rosgen (1996) channel types), as well as 2) distribution of habitat conditions within those channel types, that are as close as possible to the historic distribution of these two variables within the subbasin.	Malheur	1. Channel Classification and Assessment at Finer Scales 2. Levies, Berms, Dikes. 3. Reduce Mechanical Stream Bank Damage Associated with Grazing	41, 69, 70
Low Flow Conditions	To enhance low flow conditions such that they mimic the natural hydrograph to the extent possible, given the limitations posed by agriculturally dependent water use in the region.	Malheur	1) Irrigation Water Management. 2) Enhancing Natural Storage Pathways	42, 43, 72, 73
Out of Subbasin Obstructions-Resident Fish	Mitigate for the loss of anadromous fish species in the Malheur Subbasin through substitution programs that emphasize the long-term sustainability of native resident fish in native habitats wherever possible.	Malheur	1) Property Acquisition for Aquatic Resource Harvest 2) Determine Feasibility of Developing a Put and Take Fishery 3) Restore or Enhance Acquired Properties 4) Property Acquisition for Culturally Significant Terrestrial Resource Harvest	43, 79, 80, 102
Out-of-Subbasin Effects - Terrestrial	Administer and increase harvest opportunities of culturally significant terrestrial species in substitution for the loss of anadromous fish resources. Restore, enhance and protect wildlife habitat.	Malheur	Strategies: 1) Property Acquisition for Culturally Significant Terrestrial Resource Harvest. 2) Restore hydrolic function to riparian	43, 80, 86, 102
Restore Fish Passage Connectivity	Eliminate, to the extent possible, human-related obstructions to the movement of the aquatic focal species within the Malheur subbasin. restoration activities	Malheur	Strategies: 1) Irrigation diversion structures and push-up dams, 2) Subsurface flows associated with water withdrawals, 3) Reconnection via land aquisition or easement, 4)reconnection via	74

			Riparian and channel enhancement.	
Riparian Conditions	To achieve a distribution of riparian communities having 1) a species composition, 2) size, and 3) structure that is appropriate for the channel type and ecoregion, recognizing that the distribution will also vary in time in response to natural disturbance factors.	Malheur	1) Riparian Buffer Restoration - Rangeland Areas. 2) Riparian Zone Reductions Due to Channelization	41,42, 71, 72
Within Subbasin Obstructions	Eliminate, to the extent possible, all human-related obstructions to the movement of the aquatic focal species within the Malheur Subbasin.	Malheur	1) Irrigation Diversion Structures and Push-up Dams 2) Reconnection via Land Acquisition or Easement 3) Reconnection via Riparian and Channel Enhancement	43, 74

Section 7: Work Elements and Associated Biological Objectives

Work Element Name	Work Element Title	Start Date	End Date	Estimated Budget
Land Purchase	Land Audit and Land Purchase	1/1/2007	12/30/2008	\$2,000,000

Description

The magnitude and unique nature of the project, the project sponsor anticipates complex process agreements and coordination with the Bonneville Power Administration, Northwest Power and Conservation Council and potentially with regional fish and wildlife managers. Complete necessary escrow transactions. Coordinate with BPA and the NPCC and complete all loss assessments and other requirements necessary to forward this project.

Biological Objectives

Metrics

Out of Subbasin Obstructions- Resident Fish	* # of acres of new purchase/easement: 1120 acres.
Out-of-Subbasin Effects - Terrestrial	* # of acres of renewed easement: 0
	* # of riparian miles protected: 3.8 miles
	* End date of easement: NA
	* Start date of easement: NA
	* Start date of the purchase: FY 2007
	# of HU's protected by land purchase or easement: Project sponsor proposes no HU's will be credited.

Plant Vegetation	Forecasted Work Element: Riparian Planting	4/1/2009	6/1/2009	\$18,725
------------------	---	----------	----------	----------

Description

Plant 4000 rooted, native riparian plants along 1 mile of stream. Maintain site during the summer months after planting.

Biological Objectives

Metrics

Channel Conditions					* # of acres of planted: 2.5 Acres
Riparian Conditions					* # of riparian miles treated: 1 mile
Remove vegetation	Forecasted Work Element: Tree thinning.	4/1/2009	11/30/2009	\$18,201	
Description					
Thin forested areas accordingly to the draft Management Plan.					
Biological Objectives			Metrics		
Out-of-Subbasin Effects - Terrestrial			* # of acres treated: A total of 5 acres treated.		
Maintain Vegetation	Forecasted Work Element: Livestock Management	4/1/2009	11/30/2009	\$11,258	
Description					
Exclude cattle from riparian and acquired lands by maintaining riparian and perimeter fencing.					
Biological Objectives			Metrics		
Riparian Conditions			<i>No Metrics for this Work Element</i>		
Maintain Vegetation	Forecasted Work Element: Livestock Management	4/1/2009	11/30/2009	\$11,258	
Description					
Maintain wet meadow habitat with livestock grazing. Grazing will be utilized as a management tool to mimic natural fire disturbances to remove decadent material and increase the nutritional quality of the forage.					
Biological Objectives			Metrics		
Out-of-Subbasin Effects - Terrestrial			<i>No Metrics for this Work Element</i>		
Maintain Vegetation	Forecasted Work Element: Maintain wet meadow habitat through irrigation.	4/1/2009	6/30/2009	\$9,221	
Description					
Maintain wet meadow habitat through irrigation. Maintain existing screens, monitor irrigation withdrawal, and maintain ditches.					
Biological Objectives			Metrics		
Out-of-Subbasin Effects - Terrestrial Restore Fish Passage Connectivity			<i>No Metrics for this Work Element</i>		
Install Fish Screen	Forecasted Work Element: Install appropriate fish screens where needed.	4/1/2009	11/30/2009	\$9,221	
Description					
Where necessary, coordinate with ODFW and USFWS and apply for cost share dollars for fish screen installation and construction.					
Biological Objectives			Metrics		
Restore Fish Passage Connectivity Within Subbasin Obstructions			* Is the screen New or a Replacement?: New * Does the screen meet NOAA/FSOC specs?: NA * Flow rate at the screen diversion allowed by the water right:		

				Unknown * Quantity of water protected by screening, as determined by what is stated in the water right or calculated based on flow rate: Unknown
Conduct Pre-Acquisition Activities	Conduct necessary escrow activities associated with land purchase.	1/1/2007	12/30/2008	\$29,209
Description				
Attend and gain necessary meetings and information associated with land purchase. Conduct pre-acquisition activities to purchase fee title land.				
Biological Objectives		Metrics		
Out of Subbasin Obstructions- Resident Fish Out-of-Subbasin Effects - Terrestrial		<i>No Metrics for this Work Element</i>		
Produce Design and/or Specifications	Produce a construction design and cost estimate for pond development	7/1/2008	3/31/2009	\$10,360
Description				
Non-native fish and wildlife enhancement. Exercise public outreach on BPA's Fish and Wildlife Program. Include agency participation whenever feasible. Hold public meeting on management plan development, partnerships and involvement. Produce design and specifications of pond construction.				
Biological Objectives		Metrics		
Out of Subbasin Obstructions- Resident Fish		<i>No Metrics for this Work Element</i>		
Produce Plan	Collect agency and public comment	7/1/2008	3/31/2009	\$30,670
Description				
Exercise public outreach on BPA's Fish and Wildlife Program. Include agency participation whenever feasible. Hold public meeting on management plan development, partnerships and involvement. Produce draft plan within 1 year after acquisition.				
Biological Objectives		Metrics		
Channel Conditions Low Flow Conditions Restore Fish Passage Connectivity Riparian Conditions		<i>No Metrics for this Work Element</i>		
Analyze/Interpret Data	Develop a site specific management plan for native aquatic resources	7/1/2008	2/28/2009	\$15,335
Description				
Analyze and interpret all collected and existing data and develop management recommendations for the draft Management Plan.				
Biological Objectives		Metrics		
Channel Conditions Low Flow Conditions Restore Fish Passage Connectivity Riparian Conditions Within Subbasin Obstructions		Primary R, M, and E Type: Status and Trend Monitoring Secondary R, M, and E Type: Project Implementation/Compliance Monitoring Focal Area: Tributaries		

Analyze/Interpret Data	Develop a site specific management plan for native terrestrial resources	7/1/2008	2/28/2009	\$15,335
Description				
Develop a site specific management plan for native aquatic resources				
Biological Objectives		Metrics		
Out-of-Subbasin Effects - Terrestrial		Focal Area: Tributaries Primary R, M, and E Type: Status and Trend Monitoring Secondary R, M, and E Type: Project Implementation/Compliance Monitoring		
Collect/Generate/Validate Field and Lab Data	Baseline aquatic habitat assessment	6/1/2008	7/1/2008	\$15,335
Description				
Collect baseline data on 3.8 miles of stream utilizing ODFW Stream Inventory and Rosgen Stream Channel Morphology methodologies.				
Biological Objectives		Metrics		
Channel Conditions Low Flow Conditions Restore Fish Passage Connectivity Riparian Conditions		Primary R, M, and E Type: Status and Trend Monitoring Secondary R, M, and E Type: Project Implementation/Compliance Monitoring Focal Area: Tributaries		
Collect/Generate/Validate Field and Lab Data	Baseline terrestrial habitat assessment	6/1/2008	7/1/2008	\$15,335
Description				
Collect a baseline terrestrial habitat assessment by utilizing methodology identified in the Habitat Evaluation Procedures manual.				
Biological Objectives		Metrics		
Out-of-Subbasin Effects - Terrestrial Restore Fish Passage Connectivity		Focal Area: Tributaries Primary R, M, and E Type: Status and Trend Monitoring Secondary R, M, and E Type: Project Implementation/Compliance Monitoring		
Collect/Generate/Validate Field and Lab Data	Collect baseline data at potential off-channel pond construction sites.	6/1/2008	11/30/2008	\$10,360
Description				
Determine groundwater depths and temperatures, soil types, stock selection, pond design, and construction costs.				
Biological Objectives		Metrics		

Out of Subbasin Obstructions- Resident Fish	Primary R, M, and E Type: Status and Trend Monitoring Focal Area: Tributaries Secondary R, M, and E Type: Project Implementation/Compliance Monitoring
Acquire Water Instream	Forecasted Work Element: Increase Summer Base Flows 4/1/2009 11/30/2009 \$4,592
Description	
Increase summer base flows by allocating instream water during critical time periods for native salmonids. Close off any illegal diversions.	
Biological Objectives	Metrics
Low Flow Conditions Restore Fish Passage Connectivity	* # of miles of primary stream reach improvement: 1.5 miles * # of miles of total stream reach improvement, including primary and secondary reaches: 5 miles * Amount of water secured: 243 acre water right

Section 8: Budget

Itemized Estimated Budget

Item	Note	FY 2007 Cost	FY 2008 Cost	FY 2009 Cost
Capital Equipment	Capital Land Purchase	\$2,000,000	\$ 0	\$ 0
Personnel	salaries	\$11,289	\$31,579	\$38,673
Fringe Benefits	retire, medical, etc.	\$4,039	\$14,142	\$19,747
Supplies	office space, supplies, phone, etc.	\$5,891	\$16,326	\$19,028
Travel	per diem	\$1,336	\$1,000	\$423
Overhead	Indirect 29.5	\$6,654	\$20,159	\$22,750
Other	Feasibility Studies for Ponds	\$ 0	\$8,000	\$3,379
Totals		\$2,029,209	\$91,206	\$104,000

Total Estimated FY 2007-2009 Budgets

Total Itemized Budget	\$2,224,415
Total Work Element Budget	\$2,224,415

Cost sharing

Funding Source or Organization	Item or Service Provided	FY 2007 Est Value (\$)	FY 2008 Est Value (\$)	FY 2009 Est Value (\$)	Cash or in-kind?	Status
--------------------------------	--------------------------	------------------------	------------------------	------------------------	------------------	--------

Section 9: Project Future Costs and/or Termination

FY 2010 Est Budget	FY 2011 Est Budget	Comments
\$450,000	\$229,000	Estimated \$200,000 for pond construction in 2010 and \$40,000 for third party to supply non-native stock fish.

Future Operations & Maintenance Costs

An annual base budget O&M is \$150,000. The stocking and maintenance of the property shall occur until the successful reintroduction of anadromous fish into the Malheur River Subbasin.

Termination Date	Comments
none	This project is to increase harvest opportunities and mitigate in part for the continued loss harvest of anadromous fish.

Final Deliverables

Through restoration and protection of native species and associated habitats along with a feasible fishery in established in the ponds, the project is expected to sustain an optimum Tribal harvest of 1,421 kg (3,133 lbs) annually that shall be considered part mitigation for the loss of anadromous fish in the Malheur River Subbasin.

Section 10: Project Documents

Document	Type	Size	Date
Fix-it Loop Documents			
project response 200712000n	doc	21.9 M	7/13/2006

Documents Originally Submitted with this Proposal:

Narrative for proposal 200712000	doc	119 kb	1/9/2006
--	-----	--------	----------

Part 2 of 2. Reviews of Proposal

Administrative Review Group (ARG) Results

Account Type: Expense	Location: Province: No Change Subbasin: No Change	Primary Focal Species No Change
ARG Comments:		

BPA's *in lieu* Funding Review of new project proposals (August 3, 2006) [Download letter and table]

BPA's in lieu Rating: 3.0
Approx. BPA share of total costs: BPA 100%
Status of Cost Share:

Notes: Logan Valley/Stambro Ranch acquisition, mitigation for nonFCRPS dam (Warm Springs), other entities authorized/required (Reclamation)

NPCC Final Funding Recommendations (October 23, 2006) [\[Full NPCC Council Recs\]](#)

FY 2007 NPCC Rec \$2,000,000	FY 2008 NPCC Rec \$ 0	FY 2009 NPCC Rec \$ 0	Total NPCC Rec \$2,000,000
Budget Type:	Capital		
Budget Category:	ProvinceCapital		
Recommendation:	Fund		
NPCC Comments: Bonneville preliminary designation of "in lieu". See issue memo. No fish crediting mechanism available - BPA will not capitalize acquisition for fish. Capital component.			

NPCC Final Funding Recommendations (October 23, 2006) [\[Full NPCC Council Recs\]](#)

FY 2007 NPCC Rec \$29,209	FY 2008 NPCC Rec \$91,206	FY 2009 NPCC Rec \$104,000	Total NPCC Rec \$224,415
Budget Type:	Expense		
Budget Category:	ProvinceExpense		
Recommendation:	Fund		
NPCC Comments: Bonneville preliminary designation of "in lieu". See issue memo. Expense portion. See capital budget for capital recommendation. Budget addresses pre-acquisition activities.			

NPCC Draft Funding Recommendations (September 15, 2006) [\[Full NPCC Council Recs\]](#)

FY 2007 NPCC Rec \$29,209	FY 2008 NPCC Rec \$91,206	FY 2009 NPCC Rec \$104,000	Total NPCC Rec \$224,415
FY 2007 MSRT Rec \$ 0	FY 2008 MSRT Rec \$ 0	FY 2009 MSRT Rec \$ 0	Total MSRT Rec \$ 0
Budget Category:	ProvinceExpense		
NPCC Comments:			

NPCC Staff Comments: Bonneville preliminary designation of "in lieu". See issue memo. No fish crediting mechanism available - BPA will not capitalize acquisition for fish. Expense portion. See capital budget for capital recommendation (\$2m in 07)

Local or MSRT Comments: \$2,000,000/2007 MOVED TO CAPITAL; \$246,181/2009 REDUCED TO \$150,000 for O&M on existing properties. This would increase accordingly with future acquisitions.

NPCC Draft Funding Recommendations (September 15, 2006) [\[Full NPCC Council Recs\]](#)

FY 2007 NPCC Rec \$2,000,000	FY 2008 NPCC Rec \$ 0	FY 2009 NPCC Rec \$ 0	Total NPCC Rec \$2,000,000
FY 2007 MSRT Rec \$ 0	FY 2008 MSRT Rec \$ 0	FY 2009 MSRT Rec \$ 0	Total MSRT Rec \$ 0

Budget Category: ProvinceCapital

NPCC Comments: Bonneville preliminary designation of "in lieu". See issue memo. No fish crediting mechanism available - BPA will not capitalize acquisition for fish. Capital portion

Local or MSRT Comments: \$2,000,000/2007 MOVED TO CAPITAL; \$246,181/2009 REDUCED TO \$150,000 for O&M on existing properties. This would increase accordingly with future acquisitions.

Independent Scientific Review Panel Final Review (August 31, 2006) [\[Download full document\]](#)

Recommendation: Fundable in part

Comments: The original proposal was inadequately justified in terms of benefits for fish, and the brief proposal was not clear, with little committal on what fish and wildlife management efforts sponsors would undertake and to what extent management would differ from that exercised historically. Pond construction was proposed off-channel for put-and-take fish harvest, but adequate detail was lacking.

Information provided in the elaborate response document was detailed and adequately compelling for reviewers to now support its acquisition and restoration activities, which are fundable. From a fish and wildlife standpoint, acquisition of the Stanbro Ranch would place a significant length of riparian corridor at the upper end of the catchment under federal and tribal management and should have excellent benefits for native fish and wildlife. If the lands were acquired, livestock would be excluded from the riparian zone. Water would be diverted through newly-screened diversion points for pasture irrigation until 1 July of each year, at which time diversion would cease and the full 243-acre water right would remain in the stream channel. Project M&E was not presented in detail, but the overall plan appeared adequately framed at this time.

Reviewers note that proposed development of the put-and-take fish ponds is a policy consideration that falls outside the realm of scientific review, except for the issue of possible risk that stocked fish might pose to native fishes and the issue of needing some minimal M&E to verify a substantial fraction of stocked fish will indeed be caught. Project sponsors indicate they will incorporate a number of steps to minimize risk, but planning needs to proceed further (and the species to be stocked needs to be chosen) before pond construction is reviewable by the ISRP. The tentative nature of the process description is problematic: "Project sponsor shall consult with local and private entities to determine the feasibility of constructing ponds for a put and take fishery." As such, the design and construction of ponds is not fundable at this time.

Independent Scientific Review Panel Preliminary Review (June 2, 2006)

[\[Download full document\]](#)

Recommendation: Not fundable

Comments: There are likely some good wildlife benefits to this project, but the justification for fish is not adequate. The brief proposal is not clear, with little committal on what fish and wildlife management efforts sponsors would undertake and to what extent management would differ from that exercised historically. It appears that livestock grazing would continue on the property.

It was unclear how this connects with other properties, and with other protected areas. It is difficult to assess the potential fish benefits from this brief proposal with no photos, maps, etc. The stream is a migratory corridor for bull trout, and they might benefit if additional water were to be kept in-channel. But it is not completely clear that such would occur.

Ponds would be constructed off-channel for put-and-take fish harvest, but possible risks to native fish (which could be kept very low) are not discussed. HEP is proposed to be used for baseline assessment of terrestrial habitat, but no details are provided. The ISRP does not support the use of HEP and recommends consideration of other techniques (see programmatic comments).